



GURNEE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

February 26, 2019

- Present -** Ty Bonds, Chairperson
Gretchen Neddenriep, Commissioner
Diane Summers, Commissioner
- Absent -** None
- Staff -** Christine Palmieri, Director of Human Resources
- Public -** Randie Bruno; Ryan Constantino; Kyle Beres; Brendan Yee

Meeting called to order at 7:04 p.m. by Chairperson Bonds

AYE: 3 Bonds, Neddenriep, Summers
NAY: 0
ABSENT: 0

Pledge of Allegiance – Chairperson Bonds led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Public Comment – Randie Bruno, attorney, spoke on behalf of several recent Firefighter / Paramedic candidates that were not hired regarding what were believed to be irregularities with the polygraph process. She referenced the Civil Service Rules and Regulations and the Commission’s authority regarding ability to amend rules and administer examinations. She stated she represented the present Firefighter / Paramedics and also provided a letter from Corey Vaughan who was unable to be physically present at the meeting.

Ms. Bruno provided an article to the Commissioners from the American Psychological Association website (<https://www.apa.org/research/action/polygraph>) discussing the accuracy of polygraph tests. Ms. Bruno stated that based on the article’s findings, the use of polygraph tests in employment settings is unreliable and polygraph technology is unreliable. She stated that someone can pass who is deceitful while someone can fail who is truthful.

Ms. Bruno stated that the current polygraph examiner with Conrad Polygraph is Jeanne Broenneke. She stated she is licensed but is not a member of the American Polygraph Association and questioned why. Ms. Bruno clarified that membership is not required, but as a professional, membership in such associations would help keep up with training and provide other professional benefits. Ms. Bruno referenced her own membership in the American Bar Association because she is an attorney.

Ms. Bruno presented two print outs from the Conrad Polygraph website – “About Us” <http://conradpolygraph.com/about-conrad-polygraph-chicago-il/> and “Associations” <http://conradpolygraph.com/associations/> pages. The Conrad website stated the owner, Marshon Conrad, is a member of the American Polygraph Association, along with other associations. Ms. Bruno also stated that the Conrad Polygraph provides little information about the firm and does not list any of its employees or staff on the website, with the exception of “M. Conrad” as the owner.

MEETING MINUTES

Ms. Bruno stated that Ryan Constantino submitted to a private polygraph examination through a different provider and examiner, Eagle Eye Polygraph, LLC, Jay E. Cherry. A copy of the results of the polygraph was provided to the Commission. Ms. Bruno stated that Mr. Constantino passed that examination and discussed the different approach used by this firm and incorporation of a 'lie question' to validate the exam. Ms. Bruno also referenced the October 2018 exam for Ryan Constantino from Conrad Polygraph where the examiner, during the examination, stated to Mr. Constantino that the test indicated he was cheating during the exam. Ms. Bruno also stated there was an error in the report with the examiner stating a traffic accident involving Mr. Constantino had occurred in Palatine, when it was Waukegan, and questioned the accuracy of the examiner in preparing the report.

Ms. Bruno stated the Police Chief and Fire Chief have discretion in hiring the top individuals on the eligibility list. She stated the within the top 5 candidates on the list, several failed. She stated that the scores between the top 8 candidates were very tight and yet, the top candidates were passed over for possible hiring opportunities.

Kyle Beres then spoke regarding his experience participating in the examination. He indicated he had notified the examiner prior the examination that he had a cold and was stuffed up and had congestion. He stated the examiner and he had a conversation about that, which he felt was a bit unprofessional based on some of the comments the examiner made. During the examination, the examiner noted there were breathing issues. At the end of the examination, Mr. Beres asked the examiner if he had passed and was told yes, then was shocked to receive a notice 20 days later than he had not passed the examination.

Brendan Yee spoke and stated during his examination, he was told that his breathing rate was too slow and if he did not speed it up, he would have to come back and have another test taken on a different day. He stated he had no prior knowledge of polygraph tests. He felt the examiner purposely had him adjust his breathing rate and that made him think about it. He felt nervous from that point.

Ryan Constantino spoke to the character of Kyle and Brendan. He had worked with Kyle for 4 years and knows Brendan because his father is a Lake Zurich Fire Lieutenant. He stated the character of both the individuals was upstanding. Mr. Constantino discussed his experience with his first examination. He stated during the examination he was accused of cheating and that during the process, the measurement instruments were adjusted and the cuff was moved from his wrist to his leg. He felt nervous during that test. He discussed his second examination which was a different experience. He stated he felt better about the process, more at ease. He indicated during the examination, he did stutter on one of the questions regarding accepting a bribe and that caused him to fail the test. Mr. Constantino stated he took another private exam and that was a different process. He stated that he talked for over 2 hours with the examiner. He stated a control lie test was administered first. He stated he passed that examination. The examiner also administered a separate integrity test to Mr. Constantino, which he stated he passed.

Ms. Bruno referenced Ryan's first test regarding the question on stealing, which he failed. She stated that was related to keeping turnout gear from his position with the now-closed Knollwood Fire Department, which his Chief allowed him to keep. Ms. Bruno also

MEETING MINUTES

referenced a documented medical issue with Mr. Constantino related to a hand tremor that occurred during the second examination.

Ms. Bruno also commented on the fee charged by Conrad Polygraph of \$50 to obtain a copy of the examination. She indicated Mr. Constantino did not receive a copy of his second examination because he would have been charged a separate \$50 charge for the second examination.

Ms. Bruno referenced the letter from Corey Vaughan regarding the emotional aspects of taking a polygraph test and the changes to heart rate that can occur.

Ms. Bruno stated that she is asking the Commission, on behalf of the Firefighter / Paramedics, to review their rules and amend the guidelines to either remove the use of a polygraph examination or otherwise not use the examination as dispositive in the process. She felt the unfairness of the process should be addressed. Ms. Bruno stated she was aware that any change may not affect the current Firefighter / Paramedic candidates not under consideration but could help future candidates.

Commission members briefly discussed the comments and agreed to review the information received and discuss at a future meeting if needed.

Minutes –

Motion to approve January 22, 2019 regular meeting minutes: motion by Neddenriep, second by Summers; all Aye

Motion to approve January 22, 2019 closed session meeting minutes: motion by Neddenriep; second by Summers; all aye

Bills - Motion to approve December 2018 bill from Franczek Radelet; motion by Neddenriep, second by Summers; all Aye

Executive Session – No items

New Business -

1. Legal Representation Update: Commission Neddenriep expressed the desire to have a Lake County firm represent the Commission and recommended Churchill Quinn Richtman and Hamilton; Mark Van Donselaar partner; Commissioners would like a request for qualifications on other firms in the Lake County area, including Churchill Quinn, etc. for review; continue with current counsel on current pending legal matter.
2. Certification / Non-Certification of Firefighter / Paramedic candidates: Commissioners certified four candidates for continuation in the hiring process; all aye. Commissioners did not certify the continuation of seven candidates and names will be removed from the eligibility list; all aye
3. Acknowledgment Notice of Vacancy in Public Works
4. Certification / Non-Certification of Maintenance Worker I candidates: Commissioners did not certify the continuation of two candidates and names will be removed from the eligibility list; all aye



GURNEE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Confirmation of Next Meeting – March 19, 2019

Adjournment - motion by Summers to adjourn, second by Neddenriep; all aye.

Meeting adjourned at 8:07 pm

Prepared by Christine Palmieri on behalf of

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Gretchen Neddenriep".

Gretchen Neddenriep
Secretary, Civil Service Commission